

Records of Meetings

2022

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed

President

Deputy Sam Mézec

États de Jersey



L's Êtats d'Jèrri

Record of Meeting

Date: 22nd July 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels) Janice Hales (Research and Project Officer)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Appointment of a Vice-President	
The Committee considered interest from two of its members for the role of Vice President and, following a vote of the Members, Deputy Lyndsay Feltham was appointed to the role by four votes to two, effective immediately.	
2. Privileges and Procedures Committee	
The Committee was asked to consider the nomination of one of its membership to be its representative on the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC). Following interest from two members, it was agreed that the President would communicate to the Chair of PCC a summary of the case presented by each prospective candidate, to enable the Chair to make an informed decision on which candidate she would formally nominate to the States Assembly when the appointment process for the role took place at the States meeting on 13 th September. It was noted that under Standing Orders it remained open for any member of the Committee to be nominated in addition to the 'formal' nominee of the Chair of PPC, with the outcome of a contested appointment being determined by a ballot of States Members.	TO/SM
3. Working Practices	
The Committee was given an overview of the working practices of the States Greffe in relation to supporting the work of Scrutiny Panel and PAC, which highlighted consistent, structured administration that was mindful of information management obligations and best practice, along with the effective use of relevant technology and digital platforms. The Committee was informed that the approach to administration would enable them to have orderly 'anytime' electronic access to agendas, confidential documents (including those from the Council of Ministers (CoM)) and other key material relevant to the Committee. The Committee noted in particular the importance of Microsoft Teams for this purpose, and it was noted that certain urgent documentation may be additionally shared via Outlook. The Committee was informed that should any Member prefer to work with printed copies of certain documentation, the States Greffe was pleased to offer a print on request approach, and that alternatively Members had the option to print their own material using, for example, facilities in the States Building.	то/ЈН
4. Training	
The Committee was asked to consider initial options and ongoing priorities for future Scrutiny member training, including:	

- All-Scrutiny Member workshop on Effective Scrutiny
- Questioning/Question Plans
- Chairing
- Media Coaching
- Teams
- Parliamentary Scrutiny Visits
- Tailored Panel training/inductions
- Legislative Scrutiny

The Committee was in agreement that all of the areas identified should form part of the training offering for members working within the Scrutiny function. It was noted that Teams training would be offered immediately to members, and that this would be coordinated by officers through the respective Panels. The same approach would be taken to media training. With regard to an all-Scrutiny member workshop on Effective Scrutiny, it was agreed that a full proposal should be sought from the provider 'Bespoke Skills', to take place in September. It was considered that this event might also provide an opportunity for perspective members of panels and committees to receive an insight into the work of the Scrutiny function, and that the event should therefore be open to all eligible non-executive States members. It was agreed that a communication should be drafted for the Committee's attention that, once approved, would be circulated to all non-Executive States members, explaining the purpose of the away day and the scope of ongoing training available to Scrutiny members and extending an invitation accordingly.

TO/JH

The Committee discussed the possibility of implementing Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for States Members. It was explained that this was currently being reviewed by the States Greffe and was due to be discussed with PPC. The Committee was informed that an update would be provided as soon as possible.

TO

The Committee discussed a number of briefings that it believed would be beneficial to its ongoing work on Scrutiny, agreeing that arrangements should be made for the following:

TO/JH

- PPC/States Greffe vision/offering for CPD for States Members
- Approach of PPC on how political parties should be best reflected in the constitutional framework of the States of Jersey
- Scrutiny Public Engagement (including the specific work in respect of children and widening the range of witnesses/evidence providers)
- Jersev Public Service Ombuds
- Jersey Public Appointments Commission
- Public Inquiries Law
- Structure/Status of the Recommendations' Tracker
- An overview of the GoJ Legislative Programme (policy pipeline) and how this interacts with the legislative and administrative processes
- An overview of departmental structures, senior management responsibility, and ministerial accountability
- An overview of the Corporate Project Management Office's Project and Programme management framework
- An overview of the Public Finances Manual

5. Work Programme

The Committee considered the SLC Legacy Report 2018-2022 and discussed its initial priorities for inclusion on the SLC Work Programme, which it noted would now

JH

be drafted for the Committee's consideration at a future meeting based on its	
discussions.	
6. Scrutiny Budget	
The Committee noted the status of the Scrutiny Budget, for which there remained	
approximately £180,000 for the purpose of Review work in 2022.	
7. Meeting Schedule 2022	
The Committee considered its proposed schedule of meetings for 2022 and agreed	
to schedule its monthly SLC meetings on a Tuesday afternoon. The Committee also	
considered its approach to liaison meetings with the Chief Minister. It was agreed	
these would be scheduled initially on the basis of the President and Vice-President	TO/JH
in attendance every quarter, with scope for other members of the Committee to	
attend on an ad-hoc basis in relation to specific matters arising .	
Tallettu on an au-noc pasis in relation to specific mallers ansing.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 1st August 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
Apologies	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Moz Scott
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance, Treasury and Exchequer
	(Item 1 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Private Briefing on Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019 (PFL)	
The Committee received a private briefing from the Head of Financial Governance, Treasury and Exchequer on the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019 (PFL) and the updates and amendments to the accompanying Public Finances Manual (PFM). The Committee was reminded that the PFL and PFM included directions and information with respect to the proper administration of the Law and of the public finances in Jersey.	
A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.	СТ
2. Future Briefings	
The Committee noted it would receive a briefing from the Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance at 10:15 am on Friday 5 th August 2022 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.	СТ

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th August 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Monique Magalhaes, Research and Project Officer
	Tom Walker, Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and
	Performance (Item 1 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing with Director General, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance	
 The Committee received a private briefing from the Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance (SPPP) on several aspects of Government policy and administration: An overview of the Government's Legislative Programme An overview of departmental structures, senior management responsibility, and Ministerial accountability An update on the proposed Cabinet Office An update on the Jersey Public Service Ombuds An update on the Jersey Public Appointments Commission An update on the Public Inquiries Law 	
A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation	
or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.	СТ
2. Future Briefings	
The Committee noted it would receive briefings from the Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance, together with Leonie McCrann (Interim Head of CPMO) and Catherine Madden (Chief of Staff) on Friday 19th August at 10am-12 noon 2022 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building. The briefings would include updates on the Corporate Project Management Office's Project and the	
Recommendations Tracker.	СТ

Record of Meeting

Date: 19th August 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Monique Magalhaes, Research and Project Officer Tom Walker, Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance (Item 1 only) Leonie McCrann, Interim Head of the Corporate Project Management Office (Item 1 only) Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff (Item 2 only) Thomas Lyons, Business Support Officer (Item 2 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Private Briefing on Corporate Project Management Office	
The Committee received a private briefing and presentation from the Director General of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance (SPPP) and the Interim Head of the Corporate Project Management Office (CPMO), on the formation of the CPMO.	
 The Committee noted that the CPMO was under the Chief Operating Officer's remit, and its purpose was to have oversight of project portfolios, including: To report on performance of (mostly major) projects To provide visibility and a consistent framework for project management To make recommendations to SPPP and the Treasury Department on the above. 	
A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.	СТ
2. Private Briefing on Recommendations' Tracker	
The Committee received a private briefing and demonstration of the Recommendations' Tracker from the Chief of Staff and a Business Support Officer from the Chief Minister's Department.	
The Committee noted that the Recommendations' Tracker had evolved from a spreadsheet detailing and monitoring the progress of implementing each recommendation made by the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) and the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) in their reports, to a more sophisticated data bank programme.	

The Chief of Staff explained that there was a recognised process for tracking recommendations made by the PAC and C&AG and monitoring their implementation progress, based on a RAG (red, amber, green) system, where red signified the recommendation was not progressing, and green signified it had been implemented successfully. However, she explained that adding all of Scrutiny policy recommendations and States Assembly decisions to the database would prove more challenging as there were complex and cross-departmental issues such as legislation and funding to factor in.

A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.

CT

Record of Meeting

Date: 1st September 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Moz Scott
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Deputy Kristina Moore, Chief Minister
	Deputy Tom Binet, Minister for Infrastructure
	Caroline Landon, Director General, Health and Community Services (HCS)
	Andrew Scate, Director General of Infrastructure, Housing and Environment
	(IHE)
	Seb Perez, Head of the Office of the Chief Executive (OCE)

Agenda matter	Acti	on

1. Private Briefing on Government Review of the Future Hospital Project

The Committee received a private briefing and presentation from the Chief Minister, the Minister for Infrastructure, Directors General of IHE and HCS and supporting officers, on its planned review on the future of the Future Hospital Project.

The Chief Minister advised that, since the case for new hospital facilities had been established and accepted by the public and the project's funding had been agreed by the previous States Assembly, several factors had impacted on its previously-agreed delivery time and budget. She outlined the requirement for a review that would aim to provide evidence-based recommendations for the future of the project and to consider whether there may be options to deliver a more affordable and appropriate alternative.

The Chief Minister assured the Committee that the Government would not seek to re-run or critique decision-making of the project to date and that a new site assessment process would not form part of the review, as this would not enable the delivery of a new hospital within the required timescale. The review would be led by the Minister for Infrastructure and supported by a Principal Expert Adviser with extensive experience of large-scale capital projects in health and care. The review and advice provided by expert adviser(s) would then be presented to the States Assembly by the Minister for Infrastructure, no later than 20 October 2022.

The Committee noted the proposed timeline of the review did not include specific 'checkpoints' where Scrutiny would be updated and requested a revised timeline indicating this. It also instructed its Officer to request the following information in writing:

- Confirmation that the recommendations of the former Comptroller and Auditor General, in her 2017 report on the Decision-Making process for

the hospital site (https://www.jerseyauditoffice.je/audits/decision-making-selecting-a-site-for-the-future-hospital-march-2012-february-2016/2018) would be implemented and specifically referenced in the review scoping document:

- A list of stakeholders with whom the Government had engaged or would consult;
- In the event that no-one from the SLC could join the Government's delegation visiting hospitals and clinicians in Northern Ireland, a timely and comprehensive update on its findings;
- Assurance that the report would be forwarded to Scrutiny as soon as it had been presented to the Council of Ministers.

The Committee further agreed to seek separate briefings from the Minister for Infrastructure and the Project Lead Officer, the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Treasurer of the States, and the Principal Expert Adviser for the Hospital Project, as well as any other key stakeholders it deemed appropriate as the review progressed.

A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.

СТ

Record of Meeting

Date: 22nd July 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mezec (President) Deputy Lynsey Feltham Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Geoffrey Southern Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels) Janice Hales (Research and Project Officer)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Appointment of a Vice-President	
The Committee had received interest from two members for the role of Vice President and following a vote of the Members, Deputy Lynsey Feltham was appointed to the role with four votes to two, effective immediately.	
2. Privileges and Procedures Committee	
The Committee was asked to consider the nomination of a member to be its representative on the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC). Following interest from two members, it was agreed that background on both candidates be drafted and presented to the PPC, prior to its next meeting, asking the PPC to select the candidate it felt best suited the role.	то
3. Working Practices	
The Committee was given an overview of the working practices of the States Greffe which highlighted the structured administration noting it was consistent with good practice. The Committee was informed that the structured administration would enable them to have 'anytime' electronic access to agendas, confidential documents including those from the Council of Ministers (CoM) and other key material relevant to the Committee. The Committee agreed the use of Microsoft Teams for sharing of these documents and any others relevant to its work and if required, certain urgent documentation may be shared via email. The Committee was asked to consider the need for printing of documents and was asked to be mindful to not incur unnecessary waste and expense in printing documents. It was informed that it was not general States Greffe practice to print documentation ahead of meetings and for this information to only be provided electronically, as noted above. The Committee was informed that should any Member prefer to work with printed copies of certain documentation, it was advisable to bring any printed documentation with them, or to request any documentation be printed ahead of the meeting.	то/ЈН
4. Training	
The Committee was asked to consider initial options and ongoing priorities for future scrutiny member training, including:	
 All-Scrutiny Member workshop on Effective Scrutiny Questioning/Question Plans Chairing 	

- Media Coaching
- Teams
- Parliamentary Scrutiny Visits
- Tailored Panel training/inductions
- Legislative Scrutiny

The Committee was informed that any training would be bespoke to the needs of the Members and if agreed, could commence in September. An external trainer would be used who was known to the States Greffe, and understood the structure of Government. Deputy Scott queried if the costs for the training was within the set budget and was informed that it was. The Committee raised a query on options 1 and 2 of the media training as both were showing the same cost however, one option offered more than the other. The Committee was informed that these costs, and the training description of each of the options, would be clarified and confirmation circulated in due course.

TO/JH

The Committee asked if it was the SLC or the PPC who had responsibility for promoting public engagement with Scrutiny. It was informed that both Committees had a part to play in reaching the same objective of the public engaging with Scrutiny however, both came at it from a different angle.

The Committee agreed that an 'away day' with all States Members would be beneficial and could assist in encouraging additional Members onto Scrutiny Panels. It was agreed that a communication plan be drafted for circulation to all States Members, explaining the purpose of the away day and the role of Scrutiny. The communication plan should also make reference to the ongoing training available to Scrutiny Members, both current and future.

It was agreed that an action and communication plan be drafted for Member training and circulated to the Committee in due course for approval.

TO

The Committee was informed that part of the ongoing training for new Panel and Committee Members was a visit to Westminster to meet Select Committee Members and attend various meetings. This had been viewed by previous Members as extremely useful in understanding the workings of Government in another jurisdiction. The Committee was informed that the visits would take place with each of its own Panel Members and it was agreed that this be taken forward and dates circulated in due course by the relevant Committee and Panel Officer at upcoming Panel meetings.

The Committee discussed the possibility of implementing Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for States Members. It was explained that this was currently being reviewed by the States Greffe and Members Resources and was due to be discussed with the PPC. The Committee was informed that an update would be provided as soon as practicably possible.

TO

The Committee discussed a number of briefings that it believed would be beneficial to its ongoing work on Scrutiny. A list had been circulated to the Assistant Greffier by Deputy Feltham and was shared with the Committee. It was agreed that the briefings be arranged over the course of the next few weeks as and when possible, with the understanding that this may be difficult during the summer recess.

TO/JH

5. Work Programme

The Committee considered the SLC Legacy Report 2018-2022 and discussed its initial priorities for inclusion on the SLC Work Programme. One area of discussion was the Scrutiny budget of £200,000 and how this could be increased to allow for additional Scrutiny projects. Engagement with the Executive and Scrutiny was also

discussed with suggestions as to how this could be improved, such as quarterly meetings between the SLC and Ministers, with a standing agenda. It was discussed that as the Legacy Report had been recently signed off by the previous SLC President who was now the Chief Minister, it might be a good idea to seek early 'buy in' and it was agreed a work programme by drafted for discussion at the next scheduled SLC meeting.	JH
6. Scrutiny Budget	
The Committee noted and agreed the current Scrutiny Budget.	
7. Schedule 2022	
The Committee considered its proposed schedule of meetings for 2022 and agreed to schedule its monthly SLC meetings on a Tuesday afternoon. The Committee also considered its approach to liaison meetings with the Chief Minister and it was agreed these would be scheduled initially on a one-to-one basis with the President every quarter.	TO/JH

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th September 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels)
	Janice Hales (Research and Project Officer)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Committee noted and approved the records of its meetings held on 22nd July, 1st, 5th and 19th August, and 1st September 2022	
2. Work Programmes and Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of all Scrutiny Panels. Additionally, the Chair of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) informed the Committee that CSSP had completed its evidence gathering and was currently drafting its report on the recently lodged Mini-budget. The Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel (EIA) informed the Committee that EIA was also undertaking work into the Mini-budget and hoped to finalise Comments in due course.	
With reference to the Jersey Energy Plan, it was noted that the Chair of the EIA Panel had given consideration to possible work by her Panel, but was mindful that the topic fell largely within the remit of the EHI Panel. It was agreed that the Chair of EIA would share questions and/or areas of concern with the EHI Panel in order that they might be incorporated into their associated work.	
Noting the current membership levels on Panels and mindful of expanding work programmes, it was agreed that the President would communicate with eligible States members encouraging wider involvement in the Scrutiny function.	SM/JH/ TO
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee	
The President informed the Committee that, further to previous process and communication with the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) with a view to establishing the Scrutiny Liaison Committee's representative on PPC, the Chair of PPC had asked the Committee to formally identify its preferred nominee for the role. Deputy Lyndsay Feltham and Deputy Moz Scott confirmed their continued interest in the position. Following a vote (4-2), it was determined that the Committee would confirm with the Chair of PPC that Deputy Lyndsay Feltham had been selected as its nominee.	ТО/ЈН
The Committee noted that The Children and Young People Law was adopted in February 2022. The Law introduced the concept of 'corporate parenting' which meant that the States Greffe would become a corporate parent under the law. The	

Committee agreed it would like a briefing on this Law and requested this be arranged. It was suggested that this may require briefings from both Government and States Greffe officials to ensure that consideration was given to relevant Government and States Assembly (including Scrutiny) implications and obligations.

TO/JH

4. Establishment of a Review Panel

The Committee considered a 'pre-scoping document' from Deputy Porée, with further context provided by the Chair of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel, regarding her proposal to establish a review panel to examine issue relating to migrant workers' rights. The Committee discussed the details contained within the document and agreed in principle to the establishment of a review panel, to be chaired by Deputy Porée. It agreed that the necessary officer resource should be provided to Deputy Porée in order that she could develop a full detailed scoping document in due course for its approval to formally establish the panel.

5. Briefings held with Government of Jersey

The Committee recalled recently held briefings from the Government of Jersey, and received a number of associated file notes, in respect of the following topics:

- Our Hospital
- PAC Recommendations Tracker
- Public Finance Law briefing
- New Government Update
- Corporate Programme Management Office
- Government Professional Services Framework

The Committee discussed the ongoing review by the Minister for Infrastructure on the Our Hospital project. Further briefings to the Committee on the progress of the review were scheduled, and it was noted that the Committee was awaiting information that had been requested from the Government during the initial meeting. It was advised that officials had confirmed that this would be submitted imminently, and upon receipt would be passed immediately to the Committee for consideration of next steps. In the meantime, with the matter falling largely within its remit at this stage, excluding financing, the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel had recently held a meeting with the Minister for Infrastructure at which the project had been discussed. The Committee agreed that it would maintain this current dual approach and await the outcome of the Government's review before making a final decision on the structure of future scrutiny work on this matter.

6. Training

The Committee noted the upcoming Scrutiny training day scheduled for 30th September 2022 in St Paul's Centre. It was confirmed that the lay members recently appointed to the Public Accounts Committee would be very welcome to attend the training, and it was agreed that a reminder would be sent to all members prior to the training date.

TO

7. Future Meetings

The Committee noted its next scheduled meeting will be on 18th October 2022 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building. Having been advised by the President that he had recently been approached by the Head of Digital and Public Engagement at the States Greffe, the Committee agreed that it would welcome an update on the Scrutiny strategy for public engagement at its next meeting, should this be possible.

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States
	Katie Griffiths, Committee and Panel Officer
	Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Government Plan 2023 – 2026 and Common Strategic Policy Documents	
The Committee discussed the Government Plan 2023 – 2026 and the Common Strategic Policy and its approach to how each of the Panels would undertake their review into these documents, once lodged. The Committee noted the lodging date of both documents was proposed as 4th October 2022 with the Ministerial Plans and Annex which accompanied the documents, due to be lodged on 11th and 17th October respectively.	
It was agreed that the Standing Panels, with the assistance of officers, would have the flexibility to decide fully on the course of its review and what outcome it would like to achieve aligned to the Proposition. This would give Panels the option to develop a full report or to focus its time on amendments to the Government Plan proposition or a Comments paper on the same.	
A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 5th October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels)

Agenda matter	
1. States Annual Report and Accounts 2021 Review	
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for a Review by the Public Accounts Committee on the States Annual Report and Accounts 2021:	
Budget	
 Transcription costs at £150 per hearing: 3 hearings. £450 	

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
In attendance	Deputy Tom Binet, Minister for Infrastructure
	Deputy Karen Wilson, Minister for Health and Social Services
	Andy Scate, Director General
	Jessica Hardwick – Acting Project Director
	Alan Moore, External Adviser to Government
	Sebastian Perez, Office of the Chief Executive
	Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer
	Rosalyn Sharp, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing on Mid Way Point of Our Hospital Review	
The Committee received a private briefing from the Minister of Infrastructure, the Minister for Health and Social Services, Departmental officers and the external adviser to Government to provide an update on the mid way point of the Government's review into the Our Hospital project.	
A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the <u>Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011</u> (as amended): Information is qualified exempt information if it relates to the formulation or development of any proposed policy by a public authority.	JH
2. Future Briefings	
The Committee noted it would receive further briefings, one with Stakeholders and one from Government following completion of the review, dates of which would be agreed and circulated in due course.	JH

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels
	Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer
	Jenny O'Brien, Head of Digital and Public Engagement, States Greffe (item
	8)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Apologies	
The Panel noted the apologies of Deputy Luce.	
It was agreed that should a Panel Chair be unable to attend a scheduled meeting of the Committee, the Vice Chair of that Panel would be invited to attend in their place.	
2. Records of Meetings	
The Committee noted and approved the records of its meetings held on 14th September, 3rd October, 5th October and 7th October 2022.	
Consideration was given to the approval process for Scoping Documents on the dedicated Scrutiny Liaison Committee Team on Microsoft Teams. For clarity, it was agreed that a Chair's approval would be considered as given unless communication to the contrary had been provided within 48 hours of the respective documentation being shared. It was also noted that at the time at which documentation was distributed on the Team, should a longer or shorter timeframe be required or offered by a Panel/Committee, this would be clearly communicated.	
3. Appointment of Ombudsperson	
The President informed the Committee that, within the law drafting instructions for a new Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson Law, it was envisaged that the President of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee would be made jointly responsible with the Chief Minister for lodging propositions to appoint and to dismiss the Ombudsperson. As part of its consultation, the Government had written to him seeking his and the Committee's approval to continue with this intended approach through the drafting process. It was noted that such a role would be in line with arrangements in place for certain other appointments, notably that of the Children's Commissioner.	
The President informed the Committee that the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) of which he was Chair, would be looking to undertake full legislative Scrutiny of the draft regulations for the Ombudsperson once they were lodged.	

In the meantime, the Committee agreed that its support for the envisaged role to be included in the drafting process should be relayed to the Government.	
4. Work Programmes and Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, with most of the current work focused on the Government Plan 2023 – 2026.	
5. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC and was informed by Deputy Feltham that, following its recent meeting, PPC would be following up on automatic voter registration.	
6. Our Hospital Project	
The Committee considered the recently held briefing on the mid-point of the Our Hospital project review that it had received from the Minister of Infrastructure, his Departmental officers, and the review's Expert Adviser Alan Moore, OBE. The Committee discussed, in particular, the issue of stakeholders and expressed concern that there might be inadequate consultation provided for with clinical and patient user groups. The Committee requested a letter be drafted to the Chief Minister to raise this matter.	JH
The Committee was informed that the final report from the Minister was due to be presented to all States Members on 1st November 2022, with its own briefing to likely to be confirmed for 31st October 2022. The Committee recalled that it had been informed that the final report was due to contain suggestions for the next steps of the project and a possible change of direction. 7. Training	
The Committee noted the recently held opening training event for all Scrutiny Members and agreed, overall, that the content and opportunity for colleagues to explore the principles of and best practice approaches to parliamentary scrutiny work had been useful. However, there were some areas that Members agreed it would be beneficial to explore further training in greater depth, such as questioning techniques at hearings. It was further agreed that feedback should be sought from the wider scrutiny membership as to what future training opportunities would be most welcomed. It was agreed that this would be explored by the officers and a range of training options would be presented to the Committee.	ЈН/ТО
It was also noted that some follow up documents from the recent training had not yet been received and it was agreed these would be provided in due course.	JH/TO
8. Digital and Public Engagement	
The Committee welcomed the head of Digital and Public Engagement (D&PE), to provide an overview of the Scrutiny Public Engagement Strategy. The D&PE head took the Committee through a number of power point slides which focused on the various options available to Scrutiny to gain the most output and engagement with the public and stakeholder groups.	
The Committee asked if it would be possible to receive better notice of relevant campaigns that were being run by Government as it seemed that Scrutiny only found out about these campaigns once they had been launched. The D&PE Head confirmed that whilst she was aware of upcoming Government campaigns, she was uncertain if these could be shared, however, would check if this was possible.	JH/TO/ JO'B
The issue of reaching the non-digital community was raised and the Committee stressed its wish to ensure that such groups were not disregarded from Scrutiny	

engagement work, which it was assured was an objective shared by the States Greffe.	
9. Future Meetings	
To Committee noted the upcoming briefing on the Our Hospital project was yet to be confirmed for 31st October 2022 and its next scheduled meeting would be on 15th November 2022 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 20th October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels
	Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel - Review of Government Plan 2023 – 2026	
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel's review of the Government Plan 2023 – 2026:	
Budget	
 Public Hearings (each £150) = £300 Digital and Public Engagement = £250 Town Centre / community area pop-up stands including promotional / evidence gathering material (e.g., postcards) - £100 Social media advertising across LinkedIn, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram in the form of polls / videos / infographics - £150 Expert Advisor = £10,500 	
Total £11,050	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 21st October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Janice Hales, Research and Project Assistant

In attendance Janice Hales, Research and Project Assistant	
Agenda matter	Action
1. Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel - Review of Government Plan 2023 – 2026	
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel's review of the Government Plan 2023 – 2026:	
<u>Budget</u>	
 Public Hearings (3 @ £150) = £450 Digital and Public Engagement: Town Centre / community area pop-up stands (in conjunction with the Corporate Services Panel and other panel member representatives) including promotional / evidence gathering material (e.g. leaflets/postcards) - £100 Sponsored social media (Facebook) posts - £30 Total £580	
2. Health and Social Services Panel - Review of Government Plan 2023 – 2026	
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Health and Social Services Panel's review of the Government Plan 2023 – 2026: Budget	

Buaget

- Public Hearings (2 @ £150) = £300
- Digital and Public Engagement = £200
- Town Centre / community area pop-up stands including promotional / evidence gathering material (e.g., postcards) - £100
- Social media advertising across LinkedIn, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram in the form of polls / videos / infographics - £100

- Total = £500.00
- 3. Economic and International Affairs Panel Review of Government Plan 2023 2026

The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Economic and International Affairs Panel's review of the Government Plan 2023 – 2026:

Budget

- Public Hearings (4 @ £150) = £600
- Social Media advertising = £50
- Expert Advisor = n/a
- Total = £650

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 28th October 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	
Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel - Review of Government Plan 2023 – 2026	
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel's review of the Government Plan 2023 – 2026:	
Budget	
 Public Hearings (2 @ £150) = £300 Digital and Public Engagement Plan = £250 Expert Advisor = n/a Total = £550 	

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th November 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels

Agenda matter	Action	
1. Apologies		
The Panel received apologies from Deputy Steve Luce.		
Although it had not been possible to arrange on this occasion, the Committee recalled that should a Panel Chair be unable to attend a scheduled meeting of the Committee, the Vice Chair of that Panel would be invited to attend in their place.	All	
2. Records of Meetings		
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 18th, 20th, 21st, 28th and 31st October 2022.		
3. Work Programmes and Activity Reports		
The Committee considered the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels. With the exception of the Public Accounts Committee, the majority of current work remained focused on the Government Plan 2023 – 2026 and the Common Strategic Policy.		
4. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)		
The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC. Following discussions relating to Recommendations' and Propositions' trackers, it was agreed that Deputy Feltham, as the SLC representative on PPC, would explore with PPC colleagues potential options for changes to Standing Orders that might better compel Ministers to comply with relevant actions arising from decisions of the States Assembly.		
5. Our Hospital Project		
The Committee considered a proposal from the President to re- establish the Our Hospital Review Panel, for the purpose of undertaking a short and focused review in light of significant recent, and imminent, developments on the part of Government in relation to the location and funding of the proposed new hospital. The Committee recalled that a conversation to this effect had begun on its 'Team' channel, and agreed in principle to the proposal. It was requested that a scoping document and		
terms of reference should be circulated to the Committee as soon as they were available, in order to formalise the establishment of the Review Panel. It was further agreed that membership should be drawn from the most relevant Panels, those being		

Corporate Services, Environment Housing and Infrastructure, Health and Social Security and the Public Accounts Committee. **Liaison Meeting with the Chief Minister** An update was provided to the Committee, by the President and Vice-President, of the items that they had discussed with the Chief Minister at the first of the regular Scrutiny/Government liaison meetings held on 4th November 2022. Topics covered were as follows: Hospital Project Flow of Information to Panels and PAC 100 Day Plan Cabinet Office Legislation Programme Implementation buy Government of States Assembly Decisions It was agreed that draft agenda items would be circulated to the Committee in TO/JH advance of each subsequent meeting, both for information and to enable any comments or further suggestions from the Committee to be shared with the President and Vice-President. It was further agreed to invite the Senior Legislative Drafter to meet the Committee TO/JH to help it to build its understanding of the processes behind the formation and evolution of the Legislative Programme. **Accessibility of Scrutiny Public Hearings** Consideration was given to feedback from a member of the public in respect to the accessibility of Scrutiny Public Hearings, and to a specific request to allow filming of the proceedings from the public gallery. With regard to sound quality issues, it was noted that a hearing loop was available in both rooms used for Scrutiny hearings in the States Building, and that this had previously afforded some improvement for those who had used it. It was agreed that ensuring knowledge about and access to this option should be further encouraged amongst staff, Members and the public. Furthermore, the Committee noted a range of practical steps that could be taken by Chairs during public hearings to encourage clearer speaking on the part of Members and witnesses, and that some of the TO/ALL guidance on good practice should be emphasised in the opening announcements made by Chairs. On the matter of providing relevant information to help members of the public better understand the content of public hearings, it was discussed that a glossary explaining some of the more regularly used technical terms and acronyms could be made TO available ahead of hearings. Again, it was noted too that Chairs might also be mindful of this matter during hearings, adapting their Panel's own questions accordingly and asking for clarification from witnesses for terms used that may not be widely understood.

With regard to the amount of time that the webcasts of Scrutiny Public Hearings were available on the States Assembly website, the Committee was informed that the current 6-month window was largely informed by the contractual arrangements in place with the service provider, although all written transcripts of the proceedings remained indefinitely available. Furthermore, it was noted that the States Assembly YouTube channel was available to host a fuller 'Archive' of the webcasts, and whilst this was complicated by the alternative technology that it had been necessary to use

during Covid restrictions, the possibility of uploading all available material to produce such a repository for hearings would be explored. The Committee recalled the existing protocol for public attendance at Scrutiny Hearings, and the protocol for the filming of such proceedings that were benchmarked against the practices found in other relevant jurisdictions. It was noted that that filming of public hearings by any person or organisation was not permitted without the prior written consent of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee. As a guide, agreement to film was likely to be permitted only in exceptional circumstances, and in such cases to be restricted to the first five minutes of the hearing. Requests to film were required to be made in writing to the Committee at least 24 hours in advance of the scheduled start of the hearing and should explain why the official webcast footage would not adequately meet the intended need. The Committee agreed to maintain the protocol.	ТО
It was agreed that correspondence would be sent to the member of the public to inform them of the discussions held and to thank them for taking the time to raise the matters with the Committee.	то
8. Future Meetings	
To Committee noted that its next scheduled meeting would be held on 6th December 2022 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 16th November 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Moz Scott
	Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States, Committees and Panels
	Janice Hales, Research and Project Assistant

Agenda matter		
1. Future Hospital Review Panel		
The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel's review of the Our Hospital Project:		
Budget		
 Review Costs: Public Hearing @ £150 x2 £300 		
Total £300		

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 24th November 2022

Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
Deputy Catherine Curtis
Deputy Steve Luce
Deputy Moz Scott
Deputy Geoff Southern
Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States, Committees and Panels Janice Hales, Research and Project Assistant

Agenda matter	Action
1. Future Hospital Review Panel	
The Committee approved the appointment of Connétable Mike Jackson as a member of the Future Hospital Review Panel (FHRP), as the representative of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel.	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC)

Record of Meeting

Date: 6th December 2022

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President)
	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President)
	Deputy Catherine Curtis
	Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
	Deputy Geoffrey Southern
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Committees and Panels

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 15th, 16th and 24th November 2022.	
2. Work Programmes and Activity Reports	
The Committee considered the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, including the Future Hospital Review Panel. With the exception of the Public Accounts Committee and the Review Panel, work continued to remain focused on the Government Plan 2023 – 2026.	
The President welcomed the co-ordination that had occurred between the Corporate Services Panel and the other Panels in respect of overarching recommendations and recurring themes.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC. Deputy Feltham, as the SLC representative on PPC, advised that she had raised matters relating to late lodgings and managing the high volume of business, and timing concerns around some amendments, in respect of the forthcoming Government Plan debate.	
4. Liaison Meeting with the Chief Minister	
An update was provided to the Committee, by the Vice-President, of the items that she had discussed with the Chief Minister at the regular Scrutiny/Government liaison meeting held on 30th November 2022. Topics covered were as follows:	
 Government Plan Flow of Information to Panels and PAC. Including improved access to the Policy Pipeline, Project Pipeline and Legislative Programme Benefits of briefings – including to Ministers 	

Process for securing drafting time for legislation

The Committee was informed by Deputy Feltham that she had subsequently corresponded with the Chief Minister and the Director General, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance about a recent high profile senior public sector

	Г	
appointment, and raised the possibility of briefings being offered to the Committee		
ahead of such appointments in future.		
5. Equality Impact Assessments		
Deputy Feltham informed the Committee that although the Government had rejected a specific recommendation made by the Comptroller and Auditor General regarding the adoption of such assessments within policy development, it was a matter that the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) intended to remain mindful of. PAC would circulate further information in due course to help share its thinking in this area with other Panels.		
6. Future Meetings		
The Committee noted that its next scheduled meeting would be held on 24th January		
2023 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.		